
M I N U T E S

BOARD: HISTORIC CONSERVATION COMMISSION, CITY OF BETHLEHEM

MEMBERS PRESENT: SETH CORNISH, CRAIG EVANS, ROGER HUDAK, GARY LADER (VICE CHAIR), PHILIP ROEDER (CHAIR), BETH STARBUCK

MEMBERS ABSENT: KENNETH LOUSH, TONY SILVOY

STAFF PRESENT: JEFFREY LONG

PRESS PRESENT: ED COURRIER (BETHLEHEM PRESS)

VISITORS PRESENT: GREG HELLER-LABELLE, LYNNE HOLDEN, ANNA SMITH

MEETING DATE: AUGUST 19, 2019

The regular meeting of the Historic Conservation Commission (HCC) was held on August 19, 2019 at the City of Bethlehem Rotunda, Bethlehem City Hall, 10 East Church Street, Bethlehem, PA. HCC Chair Philip Roeder called the meeting to order at approximately 6:00 p.m.

Agenda Item #1

Property Locations: 8, 12 and 20 East Fourth Street (Molly's Irish Grille & Sports Pub)

Property Owner: WCR Rooney Limited Partnership

Owner's Address: [REDACTED]

Applicant: Community Action Development Corporation of Bethlehem

Applicant's Address: 409 East Fourth Street, Bethlehem, PA 18015

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: This structure is part of a single-story brick masonry "mini-mall" commercial building with a flat roof. Completed in late 1979 as part of an urban renewal project initiative, it shares architectural details similar to the adjacent Fred B. Rooney Building, including an exterior façade defined by large-format, medium brown brick units and street level storefronts with bronze metal frames. The building is Modern Commercial in style. As a reminder, HCC is mandated with preserving structures dating from the designated era of the Historic Conservation District (ca. 1895 – 1950); thus, this building is not considered a contributing structure to the District.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to upgrade the façade by installing new awnings and an outdoor seating enclosure between existing columns.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SIS) 9.** -- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- It is the purpose and intent of the City of Bethlehem to promote, protect, enhance and preserve historic resources and traditional community character for the educational, cultural, economic and general welfare of the public through the preservation, protection and regulation of buildings and areas of historic interest or importance within the City.
- **Historic Conservation District 'Design Guidelines'**

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: Submitted COA Application indicates intent to install new awning above passage opening along north façade at 8

East Fourth Street, to replace existing awning above passage opening along south façade at 8 East Fourth Street, to install new awning above openings between masonry piers along south façade at 12 and 20 East Fourth Street and to install seating enclosure at entry level along south façade at 12 and 20 East Fourth Street. COA Application is considered continuation of HCC discussion on July 15, 2019, which resulted in unanimous decision to table approval of proposal until Applicant submits more comprehensive Application with to-scale drawings and approval secured from Bethlehem's Zoning Officer for logo coverage at various locations.

New and replacement awnings of Sunbrella acrylic fabric to be black in color, with business logo design centered on each awning segment; color of proposed logo not identified. Replacement awning to be installed over existing frame while new awnings to be installed over new 1-inch galvanized pipe frames; all awnings to have 12-inch front valence, open ends and 36-inch overall awning height. Design Guidelines within Historic Conservation District indicate awnings were historically installed within framed openings of storefront entrance doors and windows so current proposal to install awnings directly onto building façade is unusual; however, structure is non-contributing so Design Guidelines could be interpreted as not applicable for current situation.

Proposed seating enclosure under building recess at 12 and 20 East Fourth Street to be fabricated from 1 1/2-inch galvanized pipe frames, with top of upper pipe at 36-inches above finished sidewalk and 5-foot opening centered on entrance door at 20 East Fourth Street. Pipes to be attached at piers and walls using masonry bolts installed into existing mortar joints and with stainless steel escutcheon covers. Sunbrella acrylic fabric panels in black color to match proposed awnings (but without business logo design) to be secured by rope lashing at top and bottom rails through stainless steel grommets. COA Application provides various length dimensions of proposed galvanized pipe segments; potential for interim vertical posts to be determined by fabricator.

Current COA Application includes panoramic street view of entire façade illustrating proposed awnings and seating enclosure; however, requested to-scale drawing is missing and no mention of zoning approvals is provided so discussion by HCC is warranted before appropriateness of current proposal can be determined.

Discussion: Lynne Holden and Anna Smith represented proposal to upgrade façade by installing new awnings and outdoor seating enclosure between existing columns. Applicant introduced discussion by calling attention to new CAO Application supplements that depict existing awning (to justify need for its replacement) and panoramic street view of entire façade with new/replacement awnings. Applicant called attention to remaining supplement that depicts existing business logo, confirming one logo intended for each awning segment and white in color but on black awning acrylic fabric (depiction mistakenly indicates green awning color). Ms. Starbuck requested logo color to be warm white or ivory rather than bright white in color to satisfy signage design guidelines. Ms. Starbuck continued by inquiring why Applicant did not include to-scale drawing of building façade depicting proposed improvements, as requested during previous HCC meeting. Applicant described difficulty in providing straight-on façade view so panorama of entire façade was submitted as compromise. Applicant admitted panorama is not to scale but correctly depicts new awnings and seating enclosure proportional to overall building, noting tops of new awnings will align with underside of soldier course detail at upper parapet and bottom of valence flaps will align with tops of existing openings. Applicant also called attention to dimensions of proposed awnings identified within COA Application. Ms. Starbuck noted provided dimensions (especially 12-inch valence flap detail in relation to overall 36-inch awning height) seems incorrect when compared with depiction of existing and proposed awnings; Mr. Cornish noted existing awning aligns one brick course beneath soldier course detail so new/replacement awnings should repeat that detail. Ms. Starbuck explained to-scale drawings would help avoid such discrepancies. Mr. Lader noted Applicant's intent to match dimensions of existing awning so resulting resolution to approve current COA Application should be formulated accordingly rather than identifying specific dimensions that seem incorrect. Mr. Cornish inquired if existing awning (intended for replacement and used as example for new awnings) is historically appropriate; Mr. Roeder noted structure is non-contributing to Historic Conservation District so adding new awnings to match existing would be appropriate. Mr. Roeder continued by inquiring if

existing building signage will remain; Applicant confirmed existing signage will remain but also noted building owner intends to replace signs at future date. Mr. Lader noted Applicant's statement that fabricator/installer will ultimately determine need for intermediate posts at proposed seating enclosure. Applicant called attention to two intermediate posts depicted on provided panoramic street view but noted installer may require additional posts to ensure rigidity.

Public Commentary: None

The Commission upon motion by Mr. Evans and seconded by Mr. Lader adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work as presented and described as follows:

1. Proposal to upgrade façade by installing new awnings and outdoor seating enclosure between existing columns was presented by Lynne Holden and Anna Smith.
2. Approved improvements include:
 - a. installation of new awning above passage opening along north façade at 8 East Fourth Street, replacement of existing awning above passage opening along south façade at 8 East Fourth Street and installation of new awning above openings between masonry piers along south façade at 12 and 20 East Fourth Street; approved details include:
 - i. new and replacement awnings of Sunbrella acrylic fabric to be black in color, with business logo design in warm white or ivory color centered on each awning segment
 - ii. replacement awning to be installed over existing frame while new awnings to be installed over new 1-inch galvanized pipe frames
 - iii. all awnings to have 12-inch front valences, open ends and overall heights to match height of existing awning (with bottom of valences aligning with top of existing openings and top of awnings terminating one brick course below upper soldier course details)
 - b. installation of new seating enclosure at entry level under building recess along south façade at 12 and 20 East Fourth Street; approved details include:
 - i. enclosure to be fabricated from 1 1/2-inch galvanized pipe frames, with top of upper pipe at 36 inches above finished sidewalk and 5-foot opening centered on entrance door at 20 East Fourth Street
 - ii. pipes to be attached at brick piers and walls using masonry bolts installed into existing mortar joints and with stainless steel escutcheon covers; potential need for interim vertical posts determined by fabricator
 - iii. Sunbrella acrylic fabric panels in black color to match proposed awnings (but without business logo design) to be secured by rope lashing at top and bottom rails through stainless steel grommets
3. HCC approval of proposed improvements based upon agreement by Applicant that future COA Applications for façade improvements include to-scale drawings to help foster review and discussion of project proposals.

The motion for the proposed work was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item #2

Property Location: 329 West Fourth Street

Property Owner: Chang Li and Hongjie Li

Owner's Address: [REDACTED]

Applicant: Chang Li

Applicant's Address: 329 West Fourth Street, Bethlehem, PA 18015

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: This attached brick masonry structure is a 2-bay, 2 1/2-story residential building with a gable roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. Cross-gable roof dormers are centered at the front and rear facades. The front brick façade is currently painted tan in color. Upper-level windows are 2-over-2 with no expressed lintels. The entry-level façade has been manipulated over time, with an exposed ledger indicative of an

earlier covered porch potentially replaced in the mid-20th century with a simple aluminum shed roof over a concrete stoop at the entrance door. The 1-over-1 entry-level window is not original to the structure while the so-called "baker's alley" adjacent to the neighboring structure has been closed off with a paneled door and a 2-lite transom. The structure is part of a series of six attached dwellings all constructed at the same time in the mid- to late 19th century and is Federal in style.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to replace roof shingles.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SIS) 9.** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- see Agenda Item #1

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: Submitted COA Application indicates intent to replace existing asphalt shingles due to roof leaks. Accompanying specifications identify Atlas Pinnacle Pristine Architectural Shingles in Pristine Pewter color as proposed replacement asphalt shingles with new aluminum drip edge and new aluminum pipe collars. Fiberboard with EPCM rubber membrane applied to flat roof while larger flat roof to be silver coated. Additional improvements include new half-round gutters and new round downspouts; material, color and diameter of replacement gutters and downspouts not indicated. Project specifications also describe new siding for roof dormers; however, material and color of proposed siding not identified.

HCC does not typically approve architectural roof shingles within Historic Conservation District so discussion is warranted before appropriateness can be determined. Similar previous reviews resulted in approval of GAF Slateline asphalt roof shingles in Antique Slate color. New roof work should also include open valleys, copper flashing and aluminum metal drip edges painted to match adjacent trim. In addition, discussion is warranted concerning acceptable material, color and size of replacement gutters and downspouts. Applicant should clarify which flat roof will receive rubber roofing membrane and which flat roof will be silver coated. Applicant should also identify proposed material, size and color of proposed replacement siding for existing roof dormers before appropriateness can be determined. Finally, Applicant is encouraged to remove abandoned roof-mounted television antenna as part of proposed roof renovations.

Discussion: Application was not represented so no evaluation was provided.

Discussion: None.

Motion: No motion was made due to lack of Applicant representation.

Agenda Item #3

Property Location: 211 East Third Street

Property Owner: 211 East Third Street LLC

Owner's Address: [REDACTED]

Applicant: Greg Heller-LaBelle

Applicant's Address: 1036 Maple Street, Bethlehem, PA 18018

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: This attached masonry structure is a 1-story commercial building with a flat roof and simple upper parapet. The front façade was altered in 2005 following replacement of non-historic aluminum siding with an aluminum frame storefront and stucco treatment. Vertical storefront windows atop stucco bases were installed next to the end piers while a recessed entrance with double storefront doors is flanked on either side by full-height storefront windows. Those renovations also included application of a stucco finish over significant portions of the existing brick masonry façade. A recess in the large upper cornice includes three diamond-shaped stucco details: two end diamonds are vertically oriented while a central diamond is horizontally oriented. The current color scheme of the front façade is a

combination of tan, peach and pink. The upper parapet is sheathed with a simple metal coping that might be covering a more decorative, stepped masonry cornice. Constructed ca. 1920, the front façade has been manipulated several times and can no longer be categorized as exhibiting a specific architectural style.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to install a façade sign and a blade sign.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SIS) 9.** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Historic Conservation Commission 'Guidelines for Signage'** -- Care should be taken in mounting signs to minimize damage to historic materials. This includes reusing hardware or brackets from previous signs. If reusing existing hardware or attachment locations is not an option, select mounting locations that can be easily patched if the sign is removed. This includes locating holes in mortar joints rather than directly into bricks or masonry, which will facilitate repair if the sign is removed or relocated in the future.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: Submitted COA Application indicates intent to install signage related to new business location. Large sign measuring 32 inches high x 72 inches wide proposed as main façade sign; signage location not indicated within COA Application. Sign to be fabricated from 14-gauge plate steel with irregular water jet cut edging and powder coat finish in matte black color; lettering and graphics to be semi-translucent matte white color accomplished by acrylic backer panel and back-lit with LED lighting within 2-inch aluminum box. Sign to be blind fastened to building façade through inner light box and hidden brackets. In addition to irregular edging, proposed signage includes off-set pin stripe detail around sign perimeter and three irregular circles aligned vertically at far left. Word "COLONY" in large, upper-case, stylized serif lettering centered horizontally and vertically within sign with words "EST.2012" centered above and "MEADERY" centered below in smaller upper-case, stylized serif lettering, each separated from main word by thin horizontal lines. Internally-illuminated box signs are no longer allowable in Historic Conservation District so HCC should discuss if proposed sign is historically appropriate. If so, Applicant should clarify intended location for new large signage before appropriateness can be discerned. It should also be noted that bright white color is to be avoided within Historic Conservation District; Applicant should amend proposed color to warm white or ivory.

Application also indicates intent to install new blade sign attached to new C-channel blade bracket fastened to building façade; sign location not indicated. Blade sign measures 20 inches high x 30 inches wide, with underside of new sign at 102 inches (8'-6") above finished public sidewalk. Similar to large façade signage, new blade sign to be fabricated from 14-gauge plate steel with irregular water cut edging and powder coat finish in matte black color; lettering and graphics to be semi-translucent matte white color accomplished by acrylic panel sandwiched between steel panels. In addition to irregular edging, proposed signage includes three irregular circles aligned vertically at far left. Letter "C" in large, upper-case, stylized serif lettering centered horizontally and in upper two-thirds of sign with word "COLONY" centered below in smaller upper-case, stylized serif lettering. As previously noted, bright white color is to be avoided within Historic Conservation District; Applicant should amend proposed color to warm white or ivory. Applicant should clarify intended location for new blade signage before appropriateness can be discerned. Design Guidelines encourage reuse of existing hardware and brackets for new signage so Applicant should clarify why existing decorative scroll bracket at far right of front façade (currently hidden within overgrown ivy at corner with adjacent structure) is not being reused.

Application references 4 "white vinyl lettering on panes; each measuring 24 inches high x 24 inches wide"; intended signage locations not indicated. As noted above, bright white color is to be avoided within Historic Conservation District; Applicant should amend proposed color to warm white or ivory. Application also references "hours on doors" but provides no clarification about

intended sizes, materials or colors of proposed signage. Applicant should clarify intended locations for new window and door signage before appropriateness can be discerned. COA Application includes supplemental page with various lettering types and styles; however, provided graphics and fonts are sometimes inconsistent with proposed graphics for main building sign and for blade sign. Applicant should consider unifying window and door signage to match styles and fonts of larger signage rather than introducing additional styles and fonts for secondary signage.

Discussion: Greg Heller-LaBelle represented proposal to install façade sign and blade sign. Mr. Roeder inquired if Applicant is willing to unify various fonts, as suggested by Historic Officer during initial evaluation; Applicant noted custom font designed for main sign can be used for all signage lettering but company logo (upper-case C with bee's wing detail) will still be used for window and door signage. Applicant expressed preference for lettering to be warm white or ivory in color rather than bright white, as originally proposed. Mr. Roeder confirmed statement by Historic Officer that internally-illuminated box signs are no longer allowed within Historic Conservation District but also noted current proposal for main sign can be considered different because only letters will be illuminated from within rather than illumination of entire sign. Various HCC members agreed with Mr. Roeder's observation and requested resulting motion to include language that approved signage is sandwich sign that only allows illumination through lettering cutouts and not internally-illuminated box sign that illuminates entire sign.

Mr. Lader inquired about front façade sketch indicating two locations for blade signage: one at far-right and one at far-left of storefront windows; Applicant confirmed only one blade sign to be installed at existing scroll bracket at far-right building location. Ms. Starbuck noted current blade sign proposal with translucent letters will result in lettering that does not align on both sides; as alternative, Ms. Starbuck suggested blade sign could be solid, with lettering and graphics painted directly onto each side. Applicant confirmed approval of suggested alternative. Mr. Cornish noted each side of blade sign should also receive off-set pinstripe detail around perimeter to match detail of main sign; Applicant agreed with suggested pinstripe detail.

Applicant continued by clarifying background for round signage in storefront windows is "frosted" rather than black in color, as currently depicted. Applicant also clarified that recessed windows within storefront assembly will not receive signage. Mr. Lader noted appreciation for Applicant's desire for symmetry with various signage placement but questioned need for "Hours of Operation" on both doors. Applicant noted such information is unnecessary on both entrance doors and agreed to install only on commonly used door. Applicant continued that such lettering might be "frosted" or warm white/ivory in color.

Public Commentary: None

The Commission upon motion by Mr. Lader and seconded by Mr. Hudak adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work as presented, with modifications described as follows:

1. Proposal to install a façade sign and a blade sign was presented by Greg Heller-LaBelle.
2. Approved improvements include:
 - a. new sign measuring 32 inches high x 72 inches wide as main building signage
 - i. centered horizontally along length of building façade; centered vertically between top of entry-level storefront and termination of upper façade treatment
 - ii. fabricated from 14-gauge plate steel with irregular water jet cut edging and powder coat finish in matte black color and blind fastened to building façade through inner light box and hidden brackets
 - iii. includes off-set pin stripe detail around sign perimeter and three irregular circles aligned vertically at far left in warm white or ivory color
 - iv. word "COLONY" in large, upper-case, stylized serif lettering centered horizontally and vertically within sign with words "EST. 2012" centered above and "MEADERY" centered below in smaller upper-case, stylized serif lettering, each separated from main word by thin horizontal lines

- v. lettering and graphics to be semi-translucent matte warm white or ivory color accomplished by acrylic backer panel and back-lit with LED lighting within 2-inch aluminum box sandwiched between front steel plate and backer panel; **note:** approved signage is sandwich sign that only allows illumination through lettering cutouts and not internally-illuminated box sign that illuminates entire sign, which is not allowable within Historic Conservation District
- b. new blade sign measuring 20 inches high x 30 inches wide attached to existing scroll bracket at far right of front façade
 - i. fabricated from 14-gauge plate steel with irregular water cut edging and powder coat finish in matte black color
 - ii. both sides include off-set pin stripe detail around sign perimeter and upper-case stylized letter "C" as company logo centered within sign field, all in warm white or ivory color
- c. two new window signs, each measuring approx. 24 inches in diameter
 - i. installed on lower half of far-left and far-right storefront windows
 - ii. fabricated from vinyl with irregular edging around perimeter with frosted background
 - iii. each sign includes upper-case stylized letter "C" as company logo surrounded by "THE COLONY MEADERY EST. 2012" in upper-case, stylized serif lettering to match lettering of main sign in warm white or ivory color
- d. two new door signs, each measuring approx. 24 inches high x 24 inches wide
 - i. fabricated from vinyl and installed on upper portion of both storefront doors
 - ii. each sign includes upper-case stylized letter "C" as company logo followed by "THE COLONY MEADERY" in upper-case, stylized serif lettering to match lettering of main sign in warm white or ivory color
- e. hours of operation signage measuring approx. 24 inches high x 24 inches wide
 - i. fabricated from vinyl and installed on lower portion of commonly used storefront door
 - ii. signage includes mix of upper-case and lower-case stylized lettering to match lettering of main sign in warm white or ivory color; alternate frosted white color also acceptable

The motion for the proposed work was unanimously approved.

Old Business: None

General Business: Minutes from HCC meeting on July 15, 2019 were unanimously approved.

There was no further business; HCC meeting was adjourned at approximately 6:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



BY:

Jeffrey Long
 Historic Officer
 South Bethlehem Historic Conservation District
 Mt. Airy Historic District